

Recap:

**Def:** The Gelfand width of a subset  $K$  of a normed space  $X$  is

$$d^*(K, X) = \inf_{A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}} \sup_{x \in K \cap \ker(A)} \frac{\|Ax\|_2}{\|x\|_2}$$

**Def:** The compressive m-width of a subset  $K$  of a normed space  $X$  is

$$d^m(K, X) = \inf_{A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}} \sup_{x \in K \cap \ker(A)} \frac{\|Ax\|_2}{\|x\|_2}$$

$\Delta$ : reconstruction map, matching  
 $A$ : measurement

**Thm 10.5** For  $1 \leq p \leq 2$  and  $m \leq n$ ,  $\exists$  const.  $c_1, c_2 > 0$  dep. only on  $p$  s.t.

$$c_1 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p} \leq d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq c_2 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p}$$

$\Rightarrow$  Matching upper and lower bounds.

**Cor. 10.2** For  $1 \leq p \leq 2$  and  $m \leq n$ , the compressive width satisfies for some const.  $c_1, c_2 > 0$ ,  
 $c_1 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p} \leq d^m(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq c_2 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p}$   
 (See the proof in the book class)

**Prop. 10.7** Let  $1 < p \leq 2$ . Suppose  $\exists A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  and  $\Delta: \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  s.t.

$$\|x - \Delta(Ax)\|_2 \leq \frac{\|x\|_2}{2}$$

Then, for some const.  $c_1, c_2 > 0$  dep. only on  $p$ ,  
 $m \geq c_1 \ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)$  provided  $c_2 > c_1$ .

(See the proof in the book class)

**Cor. 10.8** If the  $2^{\text{nd}}$  RIC of  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  satisfies  $\delta_2 < 0.5$  s.t.  $\cos(\theta) = \delta_2$ , then necessarily

$$m \geq c_1 \ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)$$

for some const.  $c_1 > 0$  dep. only on  $\delta_2$ .

What remains is to prove Thm 10.5

For  $1 < p \leq 2$  and  $m \leq n$ ,  $\exists$  const.  $c_1, c_2 > 0$  dep. only on  $p$  s.t.

$$c_1 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p} \leq d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq c_2 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p}$$

Upper bound:

Simply use Thm 4.12. If the  $2^{\text{nd}}$  RIC of  $A$  satisfies  $\delta_2 < 0.5$ , then  $x^*$  of

$$\min_{x \in \mathbb{R}^n} \|Ax - b\|_2, \text{ s.t. } \|x\|_2 = 1$$

satisfies  $\|x - x^*\|_2 \leq \frac{c}{\delta_2^2} \delta_2$ .

This  $\Rightarrow$

$$d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq \frac{c}{\delta_2^2} \sup_{x \in K} \|Ax\|_2 \leq \frac{c}{\delta_2^2} \sqrt{m} \|x\|_2$$

The last inequality follows from Thm 9.2 (Ae  $\mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  satisfies RIC  $\leq \delta$  if all has all subgaussian entries and  $m \geq c \delta^2 \ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)$ )

$m \geq c \delta^2 \ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)$  is equivalent to (see Lemma C.6)  $\frac{m}{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}$

Then, using the proof of Cor. 10.6,

$$d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq \frac{c}{\delta_2^2} \sqrt{m} \leq c' \left(\frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right)^{1/p}$$

Also, using  $\|x\|_2 \leq \|x\|_1$ ,  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  is the defn. of the Gelfand  $m$ -width,

$$d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq d^m(K, \mathbb{R}^m) = 1.$$

Thus we have:

$$d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \leq c_2 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p}$$

See text for a detailed, alternative, self-contained proof.

Lower bound: What to show

**Thm 10.10** There is a const.  $c_0 > 0$  s.t., for  $1 < p \leq 2$  and  $m \leq n$ ,

$$d^*(K, \mathbb{R}^m) \geq c_0 \min\left\{1, \frac{\ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)}{m}\right\}^{1/p}$$

The proof relies on two results.

**Lemma 10.12** Given integers  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\exists$

$$n \geq \frac{N}{\epsilon} \ln\left(\frac{N}{\epsilon}\right) \quad \text{--- } \textcircled{1}$$

subset  $S_1, S_2, \dots, S_n$  of  $[0, 1]^N$  s.t. each  $S_j$  has cardinality  $N$  and

$$|S_i \cap S_j| \leq \frac{N}{2} \quad \forall i \neq j \quad \text{--- } \textcircled{2}$$

**Proof:** WLOG assume  $n = \frac{N}{2}$ , else  $n-1$  is sufficient.

Let  $\mathcal{B}$  be family of subsets of  $[0, 1]^N$  with cardinality  $N$ .

Draw  $S_1 \in \mathcal{B}$ .

Collect  $\mathcal{A}_1 = \{S \in \mathcal{B} : |S \cap S_1| > \frac{N}{2}\}$

We have  $|\mathcal{A}_1| = \sum_{k=\frac{N}{2}+1}^N \binom{N}{k} 2^{N-k}$

$$\leq 2^N \sum_{k=\frac{N}{2}+1}^N \binom{N}{k}$$

$$= 2^N \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)^N$$

Any  $S \in \mathcal{B} \setminus \mathcal{A}_1$  satisfies  $|S \cap S_1| \leq \frac{N}{2}$

Draw  $S_2 \in \mathcal{B} \setminus \mathcal{A}_1$ , provided  $|\mathcal{B} \setminus \mathcal{A}_1| > 0$

Collect  $\mathcal{A}_2 = \{S \in \mathcal{B} \setminus \mathcal{A}_1 : |S \cap S_2| > \frac{N}{2}\}$

By the same argument as before,

$$|\mathcal{A}_2| \leq 2^N \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)^N$$

Observe that any  $S \in \mathcal{B} \setminus (\mathcal{A}_1 \cup \mathcal{A}_2)$  satisfies

$$|S \cap S_1| \leq \frac{N}{2}, \quad |S \cap S_2| \leq \frac{N}{2}.$$

Repeat the procedure to collect  $S_3, S_4, \dots, S_n$  until

$\mathcal{B} \setminus (\mathcal{A}_1 \cup \mathcal{A}_2 \cup \dots \cup \mathcal{A}_{n-1})$  is empty.

Thus,  $|S_i \cap S_j| \leq \frac{N}{2} \quad \forall i \neq j$  is satisfied by construction.

Moreover,  $n \geq \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln\left(\frac{N}{\epsilon}\right) \Rightarrow \frac{N}{2} \geq \frac{N}{\epsilon} \ln\left(\frac{N}{\epsilon}\right)$

$$\geq 2^N \frac{N(n-1)}{\binom{N}{n-1} (n-1)!} = \frac{2^N (n-1)}{\binom{N}{n-1}}$$

$$\geq 2^N \frac{(n-1)!}{\binom{N}{n-1}}$$

(Replace  $(n-1)!$  with smaller number)

$$\geq \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{N}{2}\right)^{n-1} \geq \left(\frac{N}{2}\right)^{n-1}$$

which shows that  $\textcircled{1}$  is fulfilled, completing the proof  $\square$

The second result we need to show:

**Thm 10.11** Given  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  if every  $2 \times 2$ -submatrix of  $A$  is a manager of  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , i.e.  $\det(A_{i,j}) \neq 0$ , then

$$m \geq c_0 \ln\left(\frac{m}{m_0}\right)$$

where  $c_0 > 0$  and  $m_0 > 0$ .

**Proof:** Consider the quadrants

$\mathcal{Q} = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^2 : x_1 \in \mathcal{A}, x_2 \in \mathcal{B}\}$

which is covered with

$$\|x\|_2 \leq \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \quad \text{for } x \in \mathcal{Q}.$$

... since  $x \in \mathbb{R}^2$ , every  $\theta \in \mathbb{R}^2$  with

$\theta^T \cdot x = 1, x \in \mathcal{Q}$  implies

quadrants relationship

$x \cdot y$  if  $x, y \in \mathcal{Q}$ .

Any  $x \in \mathcal{Q}$  is  $x \in \mathcal{A} \times \mathcal{B}$ .

Quadrants class divided by

$$[\mathcal{A}] = \frac{m}{2}, \quad |\mathcal{Q}| = \frac{m}{2} \cdot \frac{m}{2}$$

Given a  $\mathbb{Z}^n$ -module  $M$  and  $A \in \mathbb{Z}^n$ . Then, by the assumption of the theorem,  $\|A\| \leq \|x\|$ .  
 $\|A\| \leq \|x\| \Rightarrow \|A\| \leq \|x\|$   
 Let  $s_1, \dots, s_n$  be the sets introduced in Lemma 4.2, and define  $x_i = s_i$  for  $i=1, \dots, n$ .

For  $i \leq j \leq n$ ,  
 $\|x_j - x_i\| = \|s_j - s_i\| = \|A\|$   
 since  $x_i, x_j$  is a  $\mathbb{Z}$ -basis.  
 Thus,  $\|x_j - x_i\| \geq 1$   
 where  $s_i, s_j \in (s_1, s_2) \cap (s_3, s_4)$   
 $\|s_i - s_j\| \geq 1$

Hence,  $\|x_j - x_i\| \geq 1 \forall i < j \leq n$   
 Thus,  $\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$  is a  $\mathbb{Z}$ -independent subset of the unit sphere  $S^{n-1}$ .  
 From Prop. 1.5 in the appendix, this  $\Rightarrow n \leq 2^n$   
 Thus, from (1), we get  $\|x_i\| \leq 1$   
 $\Rightarrow \sum_{i=1}^n \|x_i\|^2 \leq n \leq 2^n$   
 $\Rightarrow n \geq \sum_{i=1}^n \|x_i\|^2$ , which is the desired inequality.  $\square$

$x \in \mathbb{Z}^n \Rightarrow \|x\| \leq \|A\|$   
 $\|x\| \leq \|A\| \Rightarrow \|x\| \leq \|A\|$   
 Set of all affine subsets of  $\mathbb{Z}^n$  that are parallel to  $A$ .

$x \in \mathbb{Z}^n \Rightarrow \|x\| \leq \|A\|$   
 $x \in \mathbb{Z}^n \Rightarrow \|x\| \leq \|A\|$   
 Prop. 1.5  $\Rightarrow n \leq 2^n$   
 Let  $\mathcal{B}$  be a subset of the unit ball  $B = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n, \|x\| \leq 1\}$ .  
 Then, the packing and covering of unit balls for  $t > 0$ ,  
 $\mathcal{N}(B, t) \leq \mathcal{P}(B, t) \leq \left(\frac{1}{t}\right)^n$   
 Let  $T$  be a subset of a metric space  $(X, d)$ .  
 For  $t > 0$ , the covering  $\mathcal{P}(T, t)$  is the smallest integer  $n$  st.  $T$  can be covered with balls  $B(x_i, t) \subseteq T$ ,  $i=1, \dots, n$ .  
 $x_i \in T, t \in [0, \infty)$   
 $T \subseteq \bigcup_{i=1}^n B(x_i, t)$

The set of pts.  $\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$  is called a  $t$ -covering.  
 The packing  $\mathcal{P}(T, t)$  is defined for  $t > 0$ , as the maximal integer  $p$  st. there are pts.  $x_1, \dots, x_p \in T$  which are  $t$ -separated, i.e.,  $d(x_i, x_j) > t$  for all  $i, j \in \{1, \dots, p\}$ .